**FOR DISCUSSION**

**CRC Resolution: Removal of Post-Tenure Review category from current AA-12 form.**

The Collegial Review Council was made aware of inconsistencies in the Post-Tenure Review (henceforth PTR) process, regarding procedure as dictated in Faculty Handbook 4.08 (Attachment A) and the review process stated on the current AA-12 form (Attachment B).

The Faculty Handbook 4.08 D states that a PTR candidate will submit a CV and the four most recent AFE’s as materials for review. Handbook 4.08 E calls for an approved departmental procedure for PTR, which includes evaluations from peers and / or PTR committee and a department head evaluation. Handbook 4.08 G states that these items are passed on to the Dean for review and decision and to the Provost for information. The AA-12 is not included within the PTR process in the current approved handbook.

Beginning in 2008, PTR has appeared as a category on the AA-12 form, calling for items 1-8 and 10 to be completed (as currently seen on attachment B, the 2009 AA-12). This includes departmental committee votes (#7) and a section (#10) for Dean’s recommendation and description of action. Neither of these items is stipulated or required in the Handbook section 4.08 for PTR.

**Resolution:**

To reconcile these discrepancies, the CRC recommends removal of the Post-Tenure Review category from the current AA-12 form. The CRC will work together with the Provost’s office towards the creation of a more accurate means of recording and reporting the PTR process.

**Attachment A:**

**Faculty Handbook 4.08 Post-Tenure Review**

**A. Introduction**

Post-tenure review (PTR) is a comprehensive, formal, periodic evaluation of all tenured faculty.

The purpose of this review is to support continuing faculty development, to promote faculty

vitality, and to encourage excellence among tenured faculty. This is achieved by recognizing

and rewarding faculty performance, offering suggestions to enhance performance, providing a

clear plan and timetable for improvement of faculty members whose performance is found less

than satisfactory;, and providing for the imposition of appropriate sanctions for those whose

performance remains deficient. Post-tenure review shall be consistent with the University of

North Carolina Board of Governors' policy of giving teaching primary consideration.

**B. Faculty to Be Reviewed**

PTR is required of all tenured faculty whose primary responsibilities (50% or more) involve

teaching, scholarship, and/or service. If faculty responsibilities are primarily only to one or two

of these areas, post-tenure review and resulting recommendations should take this allocation of

responsibilities into account.

**C. Timetable**

A tenured faculty member may elect to undergo PTR during any academic year. Faculty for

whom PTR is required must undergo a review no later than the fifth academic year following

the most recent of any of the following review events: award of tenure or promotion at Western

Carolina University, prior post-tenure review, or return to faculty status following

administrative service. Exceptions shall be made in the following cases: 1) when on leave from

duties, that period shall not be included as part of the five years between mandatory review

events and/or 2) when temporarily assigned to duties away from Cullowhee/Asheville during

the period of a required review, PTR occurs upon return. In the event of serious illness,

childbirth or other compelling reasons, the PTR timetable may be extended by the Provost

through a university process established, in consultation with and endorsed by the Faculty

Senate, and approved by the Chancellor.

**D. Materials to Be Submitted for Review**

A faculty member being reviewed will provide the four most recent annual faculty evaluations

and a current curriculum vitae (CV).

**E. Procedures**

Performance to be reviewed is limited to the five years preceding review or to the period

subsequent to the prior review event, whichever is less.

The tenured faculty of each department shall establish a procedure for post-tenure review.

These procedures must be approved by the dean of the college and the Provost. Each

department establishes a PTR committee (approved by the departmental faculty) with at least

three tenured departmental colleagues, excluding the department head. Whenever a department

finds it impossible to form a committee containing at least three tenured faculty, the matter will

be referred to the Provost. The Provost, with the approval of the tenured faculty of the

department and the dean of the college, will, by selecting tenured faculty from similar

departments, constitute a committee of three tenured faculty for the department. Faculty

members being reviewed are not permitted to select a member of the committee. However, this

does not preclude such faculty members from voting on committee membership along with

their colleagues.

Peer reviewers shall present their written evaluations to the department head. The department

head shall provide a copy of this evaluation to the faculty member and shall meet with the

faculty member to discuss the review. The department head shall then append his/her evaluation

relative to the mission of the University, college/school/library, and program. The faculty

member then has the option of attaching a written response. In the library the role of the

department head will be performed by the University Librarian. When a department head is

reviewed, the dean shall perform the roles ordinarily performed by the department head.

**F. Criteria**

Criteria for acceptable faculty performance include professional competence, conscientious

execution of duties–taking into account distribution of workload as developed by the

department head–and efforts to improve performance. Exemplary faculty performance, as

determined by the department, involves sustained excellence in teaching, scholarship, and

service.

**G. Outcomes**

Post-tenure review outcomes, including a faculty member’s response to a negative review, in an

academic unit must be reviewed by the Dean. The Dean’s decision, along with the

Department’s review will be sent to the Provost for information.

In the case of a satisfactory review, results are documented for university award and merit pay

decisions. In addition, suggestions to enhance performance may be provided.

In the case of an unsatisfactory review, the department head, in consultation with the faculty

member, PTR committee, and dean of the faculty member's college, will create a three-year

development plan within one month of the review. The plan shall include (1) a statement of the

faculty member’s primary responsibilities and specific descriptions of shortcomings as they

relate to the faculty member’s assigned duties; (2) specific improvements to be accomplished

within three years, (3) resources to be committed to the improvement efforts, and (4) other

support provided by the administration. If duties are modified as a result of a less than

satisfactory rating, then the development plan should so indicate and take into account the new

allocation of responsibilities. The department head and PTR committee will monitor the faculty

member's progress relative to the development plan and provide verbal and written feedback to

the faculty member semi-annually. The development plan and the written feedback are to be

copied to the Dean and the Provost. In the event of serious illness, childbirth or other

compelling reasons, the PTR development period may be extended by the Provost through a

university process established, in consultation with and endorsed by the Faculty Senate, and

approved by the Chancellor.

The plan shall also include a clear statement of consequences should adequate progress not

occur by the end of the third year. The consequences may range from suspension of pay raises to, in the

most extreme cases, reduction in rank, temporary suspension of employment, or termination of employment.

**H. Appeals**

The Faculty Post-Tenure Review Appeals Committee shall consider problems and appeals that arise from PTR.

**I. Due Process**

"A faculty member, who is the beneficiary of institutional guarantees of tenure, shall enjoy protection against unjust and arbitrary application of disciplinary penalties. During the period of such guarantees the faculty member may be discharged from employment, suspended, or demoted in rank only for reasons of incompetence, neglect of duty or misconduct of such a nature as to indicate that an individual is unfit to continue as a member of the faculty" (*Code of*

*the University of North Carolina*, Chapter VI, Section 603). Disciplinary actions for noncompliance with the development plan are limited to those established in Chapter VI of the *Code of the University of North Carolina*. Due process and the right of appeal as specified in the *Code of the University of North Carolina* and the "Tenure Policies and Regulations of Western Carolina University" in the Faculty Handbook shall be guaranteed.

**Attachment B: 2009 AA-12 (PTR included)**

# WESTERN CAROLINA UNIVERSITY (AA-12 // Current; #11-12 omitted, NA here). AA-12

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***TRANSMITTAL FORM for*** ***RECOMMENDATION ON******(1 form for each action to be taken)***  | ***[ ]  REAPPOINTMENT*** ***(Complete items 1-8, 10 & 12)******(complete # 9 if applicable)***  | ***[ ]  PROMOTION******(complete all)*** | ***[ ]  TENURE******(complete all)*** | ***[ ]  Post Tenure Review******(complete items 1-8 & 10)*** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | ***DATE:*** ***\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*** | ***PAGE \_\_\_ OF***  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | ***Full Name*** | ***Last*** | ***First*** | ***Middle*** | ***Department*** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 2 | ***Proposed Rank***  |  |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | ***Present Rank***  |  | ***Year*** |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4 | ***Previous WCU Rank(s)*** |  | ***Year*** |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 5 | ***Academic Record (Institutions attended)*** |
| ***Degree*** | ***Year*** | ***Institution*** | ***Years Attended*** |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |
| 6 | I have thoroughly reviewed the candidate’s materials and attest that the information submitted is accurate to the best of my knowledge.  Department Head Signature \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ date \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**\_** |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 7 | ***Departmental Committee Votes:******Meeting Date:***  | ***Yes*** ***[ ]***  | ***No [ ]***  | ***Absent[ ]***  | ***Abstain [ ]***  | ***Recommended by departmental committee:*** | ***Yes [ ]***  | ***No [ ]***  |
|  | ***List below the committee members in attendance: List below the committee members who were absent:***  |
|  | ***Department Committee description of review action:*** ***Departmental Committee Secretary’s Signature: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*** |
|  |
| 8 | ***Department Head Recommendation***  | ***Yes******[ ]***  |  | ***No******[ ]***  |  |
|  | ***Department head description of review action::*** |
|  | ***Signature: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*** |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 9 | ***College Committee Votes:******Meeting Date:***  | ***Yes [ ]***  | ***No [ ]***  | ***Absent[ ]***  | ***Abstain [ ]***  | ***Recommended by College committee:*** | ***Yes [ ]***  | ***No [ ]***  |
|  | ***College Committee Description of Review Action:*** ***College Committee Secretary’s Signature: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 | ***Recommendation of Dean:***  | ***Yes*** |  | ***No*** |  |  |
|  | ***Dean’s Description of Review Action :*** |
|  | ***Dean’s Signature: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_******\_*** |
|  |
|  |

**Attachment C: 2007 AA-12 (no PTR; only page 1 included, as relevant)**

# WESTERN CAROLINA UNIVERSITY AA-12

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***TRANSMITTAL FORM for*** ***RECOMMENDATION ON***  |  | ***REAPPOINTMENT*** |  | ***PROMOTION*** |  | ***TENURE*** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | ***DATE:*** | ***PAGE \_\_\_ OF*** |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | ***Full Name*** | ***Last*** | ***First*** | ***Middle*** | ***Department*** |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 2 | ***Proposed Rank***  |  |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3 | ***Present Rank***  |  | ***Year*** |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4 | ***Previous WCU Rank(s)*** |  | ***Year*** |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 5 | ***Academic Record (Institutions attended)*** |
| ***Degree*** | ***Year*** | ***Institution*** | ***Years Attended*** |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |
| 6 | I have thoroughly reviewed the candidate’s materials and attest that the information submitted is accurate to the best of my knowledge.  Department Head Signature \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ date \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**\_** |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 7 | ***Departmental Committee Votes:******Date:***  | ***Yes*** |  | ***No*** |  | ***Ab-sent*** |  | ***Ab-stain*** |  | ***Recommended by departmental committee:*** | ***Yes*** |  | ***No*** |  |
|  | ***List below the committee members in attendance:: List below the committee members who were absent:***  ***Departmental Committee Secretary’s Signature: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_*** |